

Clintonville Area Commission Meeting Minutes

Thursday, August 6th, 2020, 7:00 – 9:00 pm

Zoom Online Meeting

https://us02web.zoom.us/j/85199630153?pwd=V2hZaCtSdHVyY3BGMW9BdGd0ZGIKZz09

Streaming Live on You Tube

ChannelClintonville.com

Public attendees and viewers may email their questions or comments to:

commissioners@clintonvilleareacommission.org

Commissioners in Attendance: David Vottero, Brian Peifer, Libby Wetherholt, Judy Minister, Kendra Carpenter, Michael Weinman, Jim Garrison, B.J. White

Commissioners Not Present and Excused: Brittany Boulton

7:00 p.m. Call to order & formal welcome by Chairperson White

Welcome to your Clintonville Area Commission "...committed to the undertaking of the preservation of the values of the community through promotion, implementation and recommendation to city officials."

The CAC was empowered in 1974 by the Columbus City Charter to represent the Clintonville community in the discussion of community concerns. By City Code, the purpose of the CAC is to "...afford additional voluntary citizen participation in the decision making in an advisory capacity and to facilitate communications, understanding and cooperation between neighborhood groups, city officials and developers."

7:05 p.m. Paying Tribute and a moment of silence for John Ivanic – Assistant Director of The City of Columbus Department of Public Utilities

John passed away unexpectedly on July 27th at the young age of 52. Sharing a personal story, I became acquainted with John when I became an area commissioner in 2017. I spoke with him about the lengthy electric outages in north Clintonville and how our electric grid might be able to be improved upon with AEP and about our aging infrastructure with the abundance of water main breaks. I remember that first phone call from him. He called me and stated that he was referred to me by Council Member Stinziano. I thanked him for getting back to me within minutes of my email to which he replied, "When a council member tells me to contact an area commissioner, I waste no time doing so." From that point on, he

made sure that I had his mobile number so that I could contact him directly with any concerns I had. He was as personable as he was direct and willing to provide answers and solutions to whatever the issue commanded. John was a solid partner in the success of possible outcomes within the city in working with me as an area commissioner. We want to express our condolences to John's family, his TV family at NBCi4, and lastly to The City of Columbus Department of Public Utilities with the sincerity equitable to that in which John lived. Director Ivanic will be missed.

7:10 p.m. Commissioner Introductions and District Updates

Each Area Commissioner has 3 minutes to provide a summary of their district update and if they chair a committee, provide a brief update on the work of the committee they chair.

<u>District 1, Commissioner David Vottero:</u> District 1 continues to be quiet, traffic count is down during the day as people continue to work at home. Pre-pandemic parking spaces during the day are at 80% open and right now about 60% are filled are people are at home.

<u>District 2</u>, <u>Commissioner Brian Pfeifer:</u> District 2 is relatively quiet. I did receive some correspondence from Commissioner Minister and Katherine Cull about flooding on West Tulane Road and we have helped link those neighbors with the appropriate City contacts and await a response from the City. I am anxious to see whether the most recent rain has resulted in any further problems.

<u>District 3, Commissioner Libby Wetherholt</u>: Brynhild, Woodbine and Midgard Roads have had part of their re-surfacing project completed. It is still in process.

A District 3 resident contacted me about a possible rat problem. She had already contacted the Health Department. When they came out they said bird feeders should be put away nightly and the seed litter cleaned up daily. Dog feces must be cleaned up too. This is a good reminder to all of us that, with so many restaurants closed, rats are having to turn to other sources for their food sources. Please remember to:

- Clean up fallen fruit and vegetable in your garden;
- Keep garbage containers closed up;
- Rodent proof any composting bins;
- Bury good deep in the pile;
- Do not compost meats, dairy or greasy foods.

If you think you've seen evidence of rats, contact the health department at: 614-645-6153 OR health@columbus.gov OR 311.

As chair of Clintonville GreenSpot I am pleased to announce that CVGreenSpot will be led for the coming year by Zach McGuire and Ryan Foshey as co-chairs. They have both been active with the committee prior to this time and are well-versed in Cville and environmental knowledge. Also, Libbi Williams who had been working on our social media posts found her own replacement. Anna Kern, a Cville native, will be helping us with our social media posts. I am so grateful to these folks for stepping up to lead. I'm also very grateful for all of the members of our committee who have shown such commitment and enthusiasm for our activities.

Chair White thanks Commissioner Wetherholt for her enthusiasm for the Greenspot Committee and for achieving her goals for distributing information. You have successfully passed the torch and shown how

to successfully plan a succession. I think about that regularly as I meet with my neighbors and you have really set your successors up for success.

<u>District 4, Commissioner Judy Minister:</u> District 4 is opening up again. Businesses are starting to perk up and I was able to run to Wild Cat this weekend. I think our masking compliance since Governor DeWine's statewide ordinance is probably 98% in Franklin County and I have been showing houses in rural areas lately and am amazed at the compliance. Regarding the West Tulane problem, I had received a few emails over time about this. I sent the most recent batch to Commissioner Peifer. They have the most severe water problem I have ever seen on this west end of Tulane: 5 feet of water, to the point where people cannot do laundry in their basements. Katherine Cull is on it and we are waiting to see what the City says.

Chair White: Thank you for keeping your pulse on the water intrusion. There is lots of positive activity happening too in District 4, I believe I saw three garage demos recently.

<u>District 6, Commissioner Kendra Carpenter</u>: I am receiving mostly negative feedback from residents on the apartments behind Graceland, but there is not much more we can do about it. We have some Delawanda flooding and residents are anxious to get sump pumps and we have about two years to wait in our area.

<u>District 7, Commissioner Mike Weinman</u>: Re-lining is happening in our neighborhood again. We had a meeting with the principal at Watterson through the help of Chair White. Thank you for being so proactive about that issue.

Chair White: Thank you for driving that meeting in tandem with me. Your constituents will appreciate that effort.

<u>District 8, Commissioner Jim Garrison:</u> With respect to basements flooding, there is a new Facebook group called Clintonville Flooding Solutions that started about a month ago. There are ongoing issues with Project Blueprint, specifically regarding the bioretention basins and the pre-cast concrete units on roads in District 8 toward Indianola. Resident Elizabeth Patnoe has helped organize the residents to write letters to express concern to myself and other members of CAC and City Council. In those letters, many residents are stressing their concerns for safety for pedestrians in areas without sidewalks or street lights as cars are driving by. I thought about adding this issue to this month's agenda but the scale of this is so large that I will need to prepare more, perhaps by the September agenda. My e-mail address was incorrect on the first round that went on so I would like to share that my e-mail address is "CACDistrict8@gmail.com" for any residents that are listening.

Regarding the Historic Buildings Committee, there has not been too much action on it during the pandemic. While we haven't met in person, I do think there has also been some decreased interest and I am touching base with people and almost ready to give out assignments. The biggest issue for this committee is to continue the recognition of historic structures throughout our neighborhoods, especially along High Street and Indianola corridors. My goal for August is to bring back regular meetings. Chair White notes that there is not an urgency for this committee to meet, although it is important to bring documentation into electronic format and pitch in as needed as fellow commissioners, and offers her help on standby as needed.

Chair White: I think I have been copied on most of those e-mails and I applaud you and your district for stepping up on this issue. These letters have sophisticated terminology and are well-composed and I think they'll get people to pay attention. I think we should add this to the September agenda. I receive one to two of these every day and have been archiving them in a Google Drive and may share the link with the other commissioners.

<u>District 9, Commissioner/Chair B.J. White:</u> I see a lot more strollers and younger families walking around our streets and I've been meeting lots of new people as they move into the neighborhood. It has felt more vibrant and I don't have negative issues to report. We did get our ladder crosswalks painted after the resurfacing.

7:26 p.m. Consideration of prior meeting minutes – BJ White, Chair

On July 27th, Commissioner Boulton shared a PDF copy of the minutes via e-mail with all commissioners. She has received no suggested edits. May I receive a motion to approve as presented by Commissioner Boulton? Commissioner Carpenter moves, Commissioner Vottero seconds and the minutes passed unanimously.

7:28 p.m. Treasurer's Report – Kendra Carpenter, Treasurer

CAC submitted our report on time and we learned a lot about how to update our reimbursement information. New reimbursement sheet was sent out tonight following the exact reporting we must do on an annual basis. The categories are all updated. Please submit your reimbursement to Commissioner Carpenter by the first of each month. Our raise to \$3,500 is in effect and we did not lose the \$215.03 remainder from last year, so our current total is \$3,753.03. The big thing is to let the Treasurer and Commissioner know about you pending expenses so that we can know when we're getting close at the end of each year. There's also a tax-exempt form that we have never used but should be – however, be very careful not to comingle tax-exempt purchases with personal expenses on the same receipt. If you do make a personal purchase at the same time and place as a CAC purchase, just make it separate from a CAC purchase so our accounting is cleaner. Please use the new forms moving forward.

7:32 Katherine Cull – Neighborhood Community Liaison

If any of your neighbors receive their electricity through the City, there is a one-time per year credit for \$500 for anyone experiencing financial distress right now – please share this information.

Columbus City Schools is virtual through the first quarter/semester. The City is working to provide all students with Chromebooks and to provide hotspots so that accessibility is not an issue for any of our students.

We are having a Building & Zoning training Saturday 8/15 from 9-12 and please register. There are two each year.

Dept. of Neighborhoods is doing a series of Town Hall events. I will be hosting the event addressing the North and Northwest quadrants on August 24th. You can watch it live through Facebook and we will have 8 different programs / dept.. (Mission Zero, Celebrate One, Public Service, homelessness, My Brother's Keeper, and more).

Chair White asks whether Ms. Cull has notes or minutes from the most recent town hall touching on homelessness. Ms. Cull has a recording she can share. She also offered to forward any questions to the presenters if there is not time to cover detailed questions.

Commissioner Weinman asks about prosecution of illegal dumping. Chassidy Barham from the City Attorney's office replies that Christopher Clark prosecutes illegal dumping issues and that Adam Gray and Tim Swagger also deal with these issues; please contact Adam Gray or Tim Swauger first (*Ms. Barham shared their contact information*). It is a misdemeanor offense. Commissioner Carpenter notes that they are charged for cleanup and that misdemeanors cap at \$1,000 in fines.

7:40 p.m. Vote for slates submitted by Committee Chairs:

Zoning & Variance

Slate: Stephen Hardwick, Sharon Groves, Michael Haugh, Diane Hayford, Michael McLaughlin, Drew Miller, Judy Minister, Kelly Thiel, Michael Young

Chair White notes that Drew Miller is from District 9 and had submitted his letter of interest two years ago and has since been serving on Planning & Development. There was one other applicant.

Commissioner Carpenter moves to accept the slate and Commissioner Vottero seconds. Unanimous passage.

Planning & Development

Slate: Andrew Overbeck, Megan Valentine, Jim Dziatkowicz, Zach Kenitzer, Libby Wetherholt, Matt Brown, Drew Miller, Will Koehler, Amanda Turner (pending)

Commissioner Weinman asked about the process of appointing new members. He feels uncomfortable voting on the candidates without knowing about them. Chair White referred him to the by-laws and noted that the Chairs currently have the ability to choose committee members. Each year, in July, chairs (who serve at the appointment of the CAC chair). For example, Commissioner Wetherholt decided to step back from her chair role this summer and I asked her to work with me on a succession plan. The by-laws indicate that the chairs select the committee members, so I can redirect this question to him. Commissioner Wienman decided to abstain from these votes.

Chair Overbeck indicated that all members indicated interest in staying on, with the addition of the pending member.

Commissioner Vottero seconded. Commissioner Weinman abstained. Slate passed with a vote of 7 yeses.

Tech & PR

Ty Hulbert, Brian Peifer

Chair Hulbert thanked Commissioner Minister for her help getting the committee to this point and noted that he would like to attract a few new members. Chair White noted that Commissioner Minister built this committee by starting with nothing and reorganized the entire website. She thanked Commissioner minister for giving us a good platform from which to launch.

Commissioner Minister mentioned that she stepped down last year and stepped back from all updating last month and noted that Chair Hulbert is doing a great job. It's important for being very careful with how we respond to neighbors and she had a neighbor call her to task over an innocuous comment; she is recruiting and this is her last year. Chair White noted that with Commissioner Peifer's bio and background, he will be a great addition to the committee.

Commissioner Garrison moved to accept the slate. Commissioner Carpenter seconded. 7 yes votes, Commissioner Weinman abstained.

Clintonville Greenspot Committee

Commissioner Wetherholt indicated that the slate has all been on the committee before. The incoming chair has handled the social media before, and the committee accepts new members throughout the year. In the by-laws, the social media facilitator is written to be part of the technology committee, so Tech & PR has a third person.

Chair White notes that the roster has been e-mailed to the Commission in a separate attachment.

Commissioner Garrison moves that the slate be tabled to September so the incoming co-chairs could be present and Commissioner Weinman seconded. It is tabled to September.

Election Committee

Jan Patton, Melissa Doll, Janice Countaway

Chair Henkener electronically presents the slate full of the same standing committee members as last year. Commissioner Vottero moved that the Commission vote on the list. Without a second, the slate is tabled until September.

Historic Building Committee

Jim Garrison

8:00 p.m. Michael Stinziano – Franklin County Auditor

Trending topics with Auditor Stinziano and talking points like the proposed legislation to cap real estate taxes or upcoming triennial.

Auditor Stinziano shares information on the triennial updated, which impacts every parcel in Franklin updated per state law. In 2017, every parcel was appraised and we look at the market years of 2017, 2018, and 2019 and updated property values across the board. I know we have a number of realtors on the Commission and Franklin County has been one of the hottest markets. Every resident will be notified of our tentative value increases. I want you to be informed of our process in case you have questions. Our appraisal neighborhoods don't necessarily match up to the City's neighborhoods, but we want residents to know more about the process because they play a role.

What we send out in August is tentative; there is an opportunity to update this by December. Your2020homevalue.org is the campaign site and residents can take advantage of 1:1 meetings, which has typically been utilized by thousands of people. Mailers with tentative values will go out August 21st and we will spend December holding these 1:1 meetings. This has traditionally happened at public locations, but we have pivoted in light of the pandemic to allow people to schedule virtual sessions with

office appraisers. We will also have three pop-up locations in Hilliard, Central City, and Pickerington in which we can better control health conditions. After this, we send these values to state Department of Taxation. If you engage a review process, you will receive a notification about the final determination. If you are satisfied in August, the tentative value will be used moving forward. Three step process: 1) receive mailer, do nothing if you're satisfied; 2) if value is too high or low, schedule an appointment with an appraiser or send documents; 3) board of revision process will come if you are still not satisfied in December. 72% of the most recent round of people who took advantage of the review process did see a change (including a small percentage of people looking to sell who saw an increase). We encourage residents to schedule in advance so that we can ensure there are enough appraisers available for the meetings. The big news is that properties are going up 20% residential, 15% commercial. This is not a 1:1 for property taxes. Some communities in Clintonville will see upwards of a 31% value increase. Residents buy in at a lower price point, put money into the property, and sell, and that is where we see the biggest increases. We understand those numbers are alarming and significantly higher than we like in a three year update, which is why property owners play such a large role in this process. School districts and vocational centers have an impact on these numbers.

Commissioner Garrison asks 1) is it correct that in terms of Ohio Revised Code, the home value increase is capped at 35%? Auditor Stinziano said it cannot go more than 10% inside outside millage; levies can't achieve more than what was approved by voters. 2) Because there are so many people out of jobs right now, is there any additional validation to increases that can be provided to assure people that this is not the city shifting the burden to residents? Auditor Stinziano noted that they asked for a 1 year delay from the Ohio Department of Taxation but was delayed.

Commissioner Minister notes that the homestead exemption has not increased over the course of her 34 years as a realtor. It's been limited to the first \$25,000 without any adjustment for inflation; this was significant in the 1980s but is not as significant now. Auditor Stinziano notes that state HB 439 (Rep. Jay Stephens), which has been endorsed by the statewide auditor association, has not moved at the state level because it takes money away from the state. We anticipated this bill to move, but it was stopped up in the current Statehouse leadership changes. HB 99 (Reps. Cera and Rogers) increases the income threshold to roughly \$90,000. Originally the qualifiers were age and income, then just age, then Governor Kasich moved it back to age and income but the threshold was low. It should be at least tied to inflation.

Commissioner Minister: \$2.5 M condo for sale in the downtown North Bank area; taxes are \$3,700 / year, which is the tax bill of a \$150,000 house in Clintonville. I would like to see tax incentives and abasements curbed.

Auditor Stinziano notes that he's working with Sen. Hearcel Craig on a 3% increase cap from the prior year. Most states have circuit breakers that could be based on age, but residents in Franklin County want this to also take income into account. The big hurdle is that the state will make up the loss in revenue, and the pandemic has made this harder at the state. However, in Franklin County and across the state, folks are being priced out of their neighborhoods over property taxes.

"Drop and swap" – one of the frustrations we hear about the conveyance fees, in which LLCs are not necessarily subject to the fees to the county and therefore benefits developers but not residents, has come up especially when properties transfer numerous times.

Chair White thanks Auditor Stinziano and notes that she has a pending meeting with state Rep. Alison Russo and will voice her support for the state legislation.

8:22 p.m. Tony Celebrezze – Director of Department of Building and Zoning Services

Trending topics with Director Celebrezze and discussion surrounding accessible parking in our development of the Clintonville commercial corridors or how to enthusiastically promote the preliminary commercial and residential site plan reviews.

All of our services, while some may be modified, are moving forward. This includes permitting. Our residential permits are actually up 10% because people are spending so much time at home. Multifamily and commercial are not up in this way.

On 8/15, we will have a virtual zoning training. Much of this information will be things you have heard before, but we will also touch base on the zoning code review we are about to take on. Base code dates back to the 1950s and has been modified slightly but not significantly. Columbus does zoning by variance but that is not how the code should be operating. This will be a multi-year project and we will do outreach to area commissions and employ a consultant.

Regarding the CAC questions on ADA parking spaces, the short answer is that the ADA requires a percentage but not a specific number, of spaces to be ADA compliant. We review the Ohio Building Code and Zoning reviews it first because we look at use (ex: call centers need more spaces than a warehouse), utilize the formula and the planning reviewer determines a number. If a developer would like to reduce the parking spaces, the number of ADA spaces will be based on the number of available spaces in the lot as opposed to the front end number of spaces required.

Commissioner Garrison asked what happens when a variance request is for a significant decrease in required spots – is it unreasonable for CAC to ask for a number of ADA spots in excess to the number required? Director Celebrezze said that BZA has the power to add a recommendation; the Commission should include the recommendation on their form.

Commissioner Weinman asked who is responsible to enforce that ADA spots have been maintained. Director Celebrezze said that this is under code enforcement. If a site does not comply, it will go before the judicial system.

8:36 p.m. Tech Enhancement Program – Councilmember Rob Dorans

In July, City Council passed ordinance 1560-2020 to deposit \$47,500 in the Area Commission Technology Enhancement Program. The goal of this program is to assist Area Commissions in your ability to communicate with and engage residents by leveraging new technology, help you hold efficient and effective meetings, and promote the use of social media, websites and other forms of communication as tools for organizing and engagement. Each Area Commission will be able to apply for new tech equipment up to \$2,200. The application must be submitted by the Chair of the Commission (one per commission). Each Commission will need to designate a commissioner as the steward of the equipment. This is a one-time distribution of equipment. IT support will not be provided and equipment that breaks or needs repairs will not be replaced. The City will be taking advantage of our purchasing contracts to secure this equipment; available equipment is listed below.

Chair White: I did not really identify a need for additional funds in the materials shared via e-mail. However, I had a conversation with Commissioner Peifer during his onboarding in which he asked whether all of the commissioners have Microsoft Office Suite. It would be beneficial for all the commissioners to have searchable platforms.

Commissioner Peifer: I work for OhioHealth and one of the things we have done during the pandemic is to better utilize the Office 365 tools, including Teams and Planners. You can use it for task and agenda creation. Microsoft One Note has all of our minutes so that they are not in individual files. We could also import all of our existing PDFs into it without much effort and they would be searchable. This would, for example, make it easier to search for what might have happened at a given property as opposed to having to remember which meeting had that property on the agenda. MO Suite includes Word, Excel, and PowerPoint, and One Note is probably the best for converting a single file into a notebook. I have been playing with a free version of it and it limits the search versions as opposed to the paid version. One Note would be the most useful tool but Teams and Planners would be useful if possible.

Commissioner Wetherholt asks how that suite works with Macs. Much of the content is on the cloud so it might be able to be accessed on the browser. Commissioner Garrison mentioned that it's possible to run the platform through Safari browser, and asked about the pricing of the individual CD as opposed to a subscription service. One Note could make it easier to update agendas at the last minute without new PDFs being circulated. She also noted that there is not always a projector available for committee meetings or even the full commission if is not meeting at the library.

Commissioner Vottero is supportive of Microsoft Office Suite, but concerned that the grant may only be meant to help us through the pandemic. We may want to figure out a better way to record and host meetings once we are back to in-person meetings. He noted that there may be audio quality concerns once we are back to a physical meeting space.

Chair White sees a large benefit in having an updated link that is updated live, as well as the possibly enhanced search function capabilities within an archive cloud. She will follow up with the city to find out whether their provision includes Microsoft One Note. She asked the commissioners to review the city's grant information individually and email their responses to her.

8:52 p.m. Clintonville Area Commission – Welcome Letter Brochure Revision

Commissioner Judy Minister spearheaded the welcome letter routine and has made it her mission to ensure that every area commissioner has an opportunity to welcome the new residents to the neighborhood. Each district's commissioner received an email with the list of names addresses and an informational brochure which may be sent to that new resident. This is a good routine to ensure that every resident understands our purpose and our level of engagement within the Clintonville community. That said, the informational brochure could use some updating. Openly discuss its contents and how we may provide useful information to not only the "new" residents but to existing residents.

Chair White notes that the letter and tri-fold brochure could use a refresh and asked for feedback from the commissioners via e-mail. It would be great to promote our key roles and responsibilities and share how we work with BZA as well as sharing our social media. It also might be nice to have a revision date so that we know what we have printed is current and accurate. We could include information about zoning as well as how to submit a site plan for those who might be updating their garages, etc. When

residents ask about the preliminary site review one-stop process, they do not know that the process even exists. We just heard last month from Bishop Watterson that they had to ask for a zoning variance as a result of a zoning violation. Having the one-stop shop that Tony Celebrezze detailed included, as well as the social media and YouTube information, is important in the spirit of transparency and our purpose of communication. All too often, people are putting themselves in jeopardy of asking for a variance after receiving a citation. I am just suggesting that we enhance and improve the content and are responsible stewards of communicating the city practices, especially in light of the zoning so that people are not in violation of the law despite these free resources. A commercial real estate developer can ask what happens to ADA compliance when they seek a parking variance, a resident can ask about changing their garage setback, with just a simple handsketch of a site plan before the hire a contractor. I want to engage people early on from the outset when the buy a property in Clintonville before they move on these site changes. Nothing is wrong or incorrect about the current information, we can just be better at communicating more information and the tri-fold brochure is a great way to do that.

Commissioner Minister states that this resource started with Stu Nicholson and then Jenny at the chamber. The letter is always in a word document that comes out each month, so commissioners can update it and change before they send it out if they like. The letters and brochure are now moving on to Ty. The tri-fold brochure was last updated in January of 2020, so I object to the suggestion that it is outdated. I will step down from this effort and you can feel free to updated it however you like.

Discussion moves to Chamber of Commerce Dissolution

Commissioner Garrison echoes the sentiment of ensuring residents are up to date and mentions that because the Chamber of Commerce has stopped operations, he had a conversation with Nick Curtis to discuss the future of the organization. Even though it is not a CAC committee formally, it has been an important community resource. They do not have any intent of dissolving the Chamber and withholding passage of information or information they've accrued over the years to someone else. They are going to reimagine the Chamber. They have had problems collecting dues and other things. I have since reached out to a couple business owners in my district, including Beechwold Hardware and Mozart's, to ask what they would like to see from the Chamber of Commerce in whatever format a new entity might be. I'm not trying to personally re-form a Chamber from our community, but I think in the absence of the Chamber that some of us might be able to be an ear for local businesses so that we can continue sharing concerns with whoever will take over.

Chair White also spoke with Nick Curtis and the board of the Chamber and the resources still exist. They just need to organize and improve upon what's there. I do think it's very sad that they're now defunct amidst a pandemic because this is the time business members need an association the most. As the parking task force halted during this, it would have been nice to have the allyship of the business owners so we could have heard their concerns. I now don't know who to turn to without the Chamber. The business owners need a one stop shop for their opinion on development, which is in our wheelhouse. So feel empowered to do what you need to do. It would be a great start to pick up the phone and start calling businesses in your own district.

8:40 p.m. Public Comments and Open Discussion

9:09 p.m Meeting Adjourned - Commissioner Wetherholt moved to adjourn, Commissioner Garrison seconded.